## Multiple Pathways to Biliteracy



## CaliforniansTOgether

Championing the Success of English Learners


This publication was written by Laurie Olsen.
For more information about the Multiple Pathways to Biliteracy or about the Multiple Pathways to Biliteracy District Recognition Awards, contact:

Shelly Spiegel-Coleman, Executive Director
Californians Together
525 East Seventh Street, Suite 207
Long Beach, CA 90813
562-983-1333
Shelly@californianstogether.org
www.californianstogether.org

Californians Together is a statewide coalition of parents, teachers, administrators, board members, and civil rights non-profit organizations. Our member organizations come together united around the goal of better educating California's almost 1.4 million English Learners by improving California's schools and promoting equitable educational policy.

## Preface

Five years after California became the first state in the nation to adopt a State Seal of Biliteracy, igniting a national movement, California voters overwhelmingly ( $73.5 \%$ ) supported the passage of Proposition 58 the LEARN Initiative to promote and encourage multilingual programs for all students. This new mandate represents a sea-change from 18 years prior when $61 \%$ of the electorate voted to basically outlaw bilingual programs through a different statewide proposition.

Parents and educators are now encouraged and empowered to implement multilingual programs, preschool through 12th grade, for all students. Building pathways to biliteracy requires communities and school leaders to become familiar with the variety of language program options, the research behind them, and the conditions that support effective implementation. A collaborative process of dialogue about goals and purposes, and planning for appropriate options for each community should engage all stakeholders. What do we want for our children? Which programs are feasible given our demographics and resources?

This publication is a resource for all stakeholders as they begin to think about planning for and implementing multilingual pathways to biliteracy and realizing the opportunities afforded by Proposition 58. The Local Control Funding Formula provides the vehicle for local decision-making and investments to realize the opportunity within Proposition 58 to provide a 21 st century language education for students from preschool through high schools. As of 2016, over 126,000 seniors have been awarded the State Seal of Biliteracy for their attainment of proficiency in English and another language. Now, it is time for schools and districts to chart the future for all of California's students to graduate proficient in English and one or more additional languages.

## Table of Contents

Introduction ..... 1
Background ..... 3
Where We Stand ..... 7
Charting Pathways to Biliteracy ..... 10
Guidance for Districts ..... 14
Award Eligibility ..... 22
Moving the State Forward ..... 23
Appendix: What Are Other States Doing?


## INTRODUCTION

It is time for a new campaign across California to develop preschool through high school programs that will prepare students with proficiency in two or more languages so they may speak to, from and across multiple communities and nations. This California Campaign for Biliteracy seeks to engage educators, policymakers, parents and students who share the vision of multilingualism, and also understand the enormous benefits to individuals, society and the economy. Together we hope to inspire the development of strong dual language programs, multiple opportunities and comprehensive pathways enabling all students to reach the goal of high levels of proficiency in two or more languages, fully qualified to receive the Seal of Biliteracy (Seal) recognition upon high school graduation.

In 2012, California became the first state in the nation to award a state Seal of Biliteracy to graduating seniors with demonstrated proficiency in two or more languages. This groundbreaking step was an acknowledgement of the economic and social value of multilingualism, the realities of a global century, and of the high level of academic achievement associated with attaining literacy in multiple languages. The creation of the Seal of Biliteracy, in the context of the rollout of new Common Core standards, rounded out the very notion of college and career readiness for this diverse and global $21^{\text {st }}$ century world.

[^0]Ten thousand Seals were awarded in the first year for proficiency in 29 languages, including American Sign Language. One year later, in June of 2013, the number had more than doubled with 197 school districts, 19 charter schools and six county offices of education providing 21,655 awards to
 graduating seniors. Across the nation, other states were inspired to follow California's lead. In 2013, New York, Texas, New Mexico and Illinois adopted state Seals of Biliteracy. In 2014, Washington state followed suit, and three additional states have pending legislation at this writing (Florida, Massachusetts and Maryland).

As the word has spread, excitement about the Seal and the increased awareness of the benefits of multilingual proficiency has led forward-thinking districts to invest in designing articulated bilingual and world language programs, build coherent pathways, and set policy to encourage and support the
development of biliteracy. The Campaign for Biliteracy seeks to honor those visionary districts, as well as encourage others to follow suit. The reality is that in most schools and districts, students and parents look around and have to ask: "Where are the programs that will prepare students to attain multilingual skills? What are the pathways to bigh-level proficiency?" In most cases, district leaders are just beginning to ask, "If we are serious about the benefits of biliteracy and the need for students to be prepared for this $21^{\text {st }}$ century global world, are our language programs adequate and equitably accessible?"

Throughout California, the answers to these questions point to the need for action. World language programs are inadequate; the vast majority of children who come to school with the resource of a language other than English lose their home language in the process of becoming English proficient; the opportunities for developing proficiency in two or more languages is limited and inequitably accessible. This publication, and the launch of a California Campaign for Biliteracy, aim to focus attention on building pathways to biliteracy that are articulated, comprehensive, and effective in preparing students for the use of bilingual skills in careers, and for active engagement in the communities of California - the most diverse state in the nation - and throughout the world in a global $21^{\text {st }}$ century.

Preparing students for careers, employment and participation in the $21^{\text {st }}$ century global world requires pathways and varied language learning opportunities that build towards the global competency and linguistic skills students need. Such pathways can address a shortfall in needed skills in our communities and economy, and are concrete recognition of the vibrancy and value of cultural diversity. Furthermore, pathways towards biliteracy help address the achievement gap for English Learners. California, the birthplace of the Seal of Biliteracy, is the place to break new ground in the creation of comprehensive, articulated and powerful dual language pathways. As with the Seal of Biliteracy, the hope is that the Campaign for Biliteracy will build towards a global competency and linguistic skills.

To assist districts in working towards comprehensive pathways to biliteracy, this publication includes:

- Overview of research about the benefits of biliteracy
- Rationale for the importance of preparing multiliterate students
- Analysis of the current state of world language, dual language and bilingual education in California
- A description of program models and language-learning opportunities that can be combined into comprehensive pathways preschool through high school
- Principles, characteristics and steps for creating and supporting quality language pathways
- District case examples and quotes from educational leaders engaged in building pathways to biliteracy
- The criteria for achieving a Multiple Pathways to Biliteracy District Recognition Award


## BACKGROUND

## The Importance of Preparing Multi-Literate Students

The groundswell of California districts signing on to offer the Seal of Biliteracy was motivated by a number of purposes:

- To encourage students to study world languages
- To certify the attainment of biliteracy skills - for employers, and for colleges
- To communicate the value of language diversity
- To prepare students with $21^{\text {st }}$ century skills that will benefit them in the labor market and the global society
- To strengthen intergroup relationships and honor the multiple cultures and languages in a community.

The move to make the Seal of Biliteracy a possibility for more students by crafting pathways towards biliteracy is similarly motivated. It builds upon increasingly strong research about the benefits of mastery of two or more languages for individual students, and the increasing awareness of the need in our communities, state, nation and world for people with biliteracy and cross-cultural skills.


## Biliteracy Benefits Our Students

Mastering Two or More Languages Has Enormous Benefits for Students People who are able to speak, read and write in two or more languages are able to participate in several different cultural and language worlds. Multilingual proficiency actually strengthens how the brain functions. Bilingualism is associated with more cognitive flexibility and better problem solving abilities. Children who are bilingual tend to perform better on achievement tests.

Furthermore, bilingual students engage in less negative cultural stereotyping and have more favorable attitudes towards people who are different from themselves. Job opportunities become available throughout the globe for those who are bilingual, and there are often financial benefits associated with bilingual skills in the labor market.


Academic Advantages Studying world languages offers numerous academic benefits. It not only prepares students to communicate in that language, but also increases academic performance in other subjects. Higher levels of proficiency in two languages are associated with higher levels of performance on achievement tests - particularly those areas related to language and literacy. This is because meta-awareness of how language works, and the contrastive awareness across different language systems bolster overall literacy proficiency. For students who come to school as English Learners, the simultaneous development of both English and their home language is associated with stronger performance in English than students who are educated monolingually.

Economic Advantages As the global economy grows, so does the importance of preparing students to become proficient in at least one other world language in addition to English. Fluency in more than one language and the cross-cultural skills that are attained along with the knowledge of multiple languages are prized and rewarded with higher salaries by many businesses and companies. The globalization of the world's economies has created a host of new and different demands on the workforce. In addition to customary careers where bilingual skills are obviously needed, knowledge of languages and cultures extends possibilities for employment in less traditional and more global careers around the word. Many career opportunities are available to people who communicate well in English and are proficient in other languages - these opportunities are even greater when that proficiency includes reading and writing capacity in those languages.

Social Advantages and Cross-Cultural Competency Being bilingual offers students the opportunity to develop relationships across cultures. It has been found that students who study world languages display more tolerance for, and more interest in, other cultures. Cultural awareness and competency is enhanced - and empathy for other groups developed. Study of another language expands one's worldview and builds cross-cultural understanding.

Stronger Family Cohesion and Heritage Connection More than one-third of California school children speak a language other than English at home. The development of strong bilingual skills that include home language and English provide them the capacity to participate actively in both of their language worlds, and to be bridge builders and translators for their families. Now, the majority loses proficiency in their home language, harming connection to family and heritage. With the development of strong bilingual skills, their relationships to family are enhanced and access to the wisdom of their heritage culture is facilitated.

## Biliteracy Benefits Our State

Graduating Multilingual Students Greatly Benefits Our State California needs people with biliteracy skills and cross-cultural competencies to work in and fuel our economy, to strengthen our social cohesion, and to enrich the quality of life in our communities.

Our Economy California leads the nation in exports to foreign countries around the world particularly the large markets of North America, Asia and Europe. More than one million highpaying jobs depend on California's connections to those foreign markets. Education in world languages and cross-cultural competencies should be one component of a successful economic stimulus plan for the state. Employers in all sectors cite the benefits of having bilingual employees. The advantages they cite include: more effective customer service and marketing, ability to translate and work with diverse clientele, and better work relations with diverse coworkers.

Whether students become diplomats, intelligence and foreign policy
 experts, politicians, military leaders, business leaders, scientists, physicians, entrepreneurs, educational leaders, managers, doctors and health care providers, technicians, historians, artists, police, social workers or pursue hundreds of other careers, biliteracy skills will

Our Communities Over 100 languages are spoken in the homes of Californians. By 2050, more than half of California's population will be of Hispanic, Asian or of Pacific Islander descent; a large percentage will speak a language other than English. Throughout our diverse communities, the capacity of health care systems, social services, government and public health systems to reach and serve those in need depends upon having workers with bilingual language skills and cross-cultural competence. The inability to deliver services respectfully, accessibly and appropriately greatly impacts on the quality of life in our communities.


## Where We Stand

## Insufficient Language Programs and Pathways to Biliteracy

While access to a global economy is increasing and our economy and communities require more people with strong biliteracy skills, and while research mounts on the benefits of biliteracy to individuals, California's public schools are not adequately preparing our students to develop proficiency in more than one language. Very few students in the United States begin foreign language study by sixth grade, and California's children are no exception. According to the Center for Applied Linguistics 2008 national survey of public and private schools, the percentage of elementary schools offering foreign languages decreased significantly from $24 \%$ to $15 \%$ in the decade from 1997 to 2008. Most classes offered at the K-6 level are introductory or exploratory, and are not intended to lead students to higher levels of language proficiency in subsequent years. Yet we know that language instruction is most effective when it begins early. By waiting to enroll in foreign languages until high school, students significantly reduce their chances of reaching meaningful levels of bilingual language proficiency.

In California schools, over 1.3 million students enroll as English Learners, bringing with them the resource of a language other than English. Yet few are instructed in a dual language bilingual setting. The number of English Learners receiving biliteracy education dropped precipitously from 30\% in 1998 to less than $5 \%$ in 2013.

Foreign language enrollment in California middle schools is significantly below the national average (at just $8.23 \%$ ). At the high school level, California's rate of $40.34 \%$ student enrollment in world language classes is just below the national average of $43.8 \%$. Having less than half of the student population enrolled in world languages is not sufficient, especially in comparison to foreign language study in European nations. On average, $60.5 \%$ of students in lower secondary education in Europe were learning two or more foreign languages. Students in Europe generally begin foreign language study between ages five and nine (per Key Data on Teaching Languages at School in Europe, 2012). World Language instruction has shown little growth over the past decade.

## The Tide is Turning - The Time is Now

The tide is turning. California, which two decades ago adopted anti-bilingual education policy and was heading in the direction of a monolingual English-Only state, is now undergoing an awakening. California now boasts 306 two-way dual immersion programs, with more added each year. Waiting lists are typically long for slots in these programs as knowledgeable, educated parents scramble to get their children the advantages of a dual language education.

In 2009, California adopted its first World Languages Content Standards, providing direction for the state's world Language programs.


#### Abstract

"To succeed in the $21^{\text {st }}$ century, today's students need to develop academic knowledge, proficiency in English, and linguistic and cultural literacy in several of the world's languages and cultures.The ability to communicate in culturally appropriate ways in a variety of settings will ensure success in a technologically driven global economy and increase intercultural understanding and the benefits derived from collaborative international efforts. Success in an interconnected world depends on students' effective use of language and cross-cultural communication skills. As a result of culturally appropriate language use, students will enhance their ability to effectively carry out a wide range of tasks with a high level of control of the linguistic system. We can no longer afford to simply learn about languages and cultures; but rather, we must provide students with opportunities to learn languages and cultures by participating in communicative interactions that prepare for real-world language use and global citizenship. Language learning needs to be a lifelong endeavor." "Developing Global Competency" Introduction to the California World Languages Content Standards.


In 2011, State Superintendent Tom Torlakson began his administration with convening a Transition Advisory Team to help develop the "Blueprint for Great Schools." Included in that blueprint was a recommendation: "Ensure English literacy and biliteracy through a statewide campaign to better prepare parents and educators to support literacy. Adopt a California Literacy Plan for birth through $12^{\text {th }}$ grade that builds upon research for developmentally appropriate written and oral language development in home and in second language; create English language development standards and curriculum; and recognize California students for being literate in English and one or more additional languages by awarding a State Seal of Biliteracy."

Indeed, in 2012, following the lead of over fifty school districts that had already adopted a Seal of Biliteracy to recognize the skills and value of bilingualism, the state Legislature established the California State Seal of Biliteracy in recognition of the value of a biliterate and multiliterate citizenry not just for an individual's benefit but also for the state.


In 2013, a new English Language Arts/English Language Development Framework was drafted aligned to the new Common Core standards, including in it support for the development of biliteracy. While noting that it is beyond the actual scope of the ELA/ELD framework, the document nonetheless notes that "literacy and language proficiency in languages other than English are bighly desirable and advantageous for California's students and the state." The document cites the research supporting bilingual programs, including the enhanced metalinguistic and metacognitive benefits of bilingualism. For all students, "...bilingualism is a cognitive and linguistic asset. Developing the language used in the home by parents, grandparents, or other relatives also promotes healthy self-image, pride in one's heritage, and greater connection with one's community. This cultural awareness and appreciation for diversity is, in fact, critical for all students to develop in order to prepare to be global-minded individuals."

For many educators and policymakers, the advent of the $21^{\text {st }}$ century prompted a rethinking and revisioning of what education must be for the new century. California joined with other states in adopting a Partnership for $21^{\text {st }}$ Century Education (P21) framework of $21^{\text {st }}$ century student outcomes. The framework presents a holistic view of $21^{\text {st }}$ century teaching and learning that combines a discrete focus on $21^{\text {st }}$ century student outcomes (a blending of specific skills communication, collaboration, critical thinking and creativity - content knowledge, expertise and literacies) required of them in the $21^{\text {st }}$ century and beyond. The framework makes clear that it is vital that $21^{\text {st }}$ century education include learning from and working collaboratively with individuals representing diverse cultures in a spirit of mutual respect and open dialogue in personal, work and community contexts as well as supporting academic literacy in world languages so that students will be prepared for the challenges of a global economy.
A $21^{\text {st }}$ century education develops biliteracy and cross-cultural skills.

The value of biliteracy has taken hold, but our schools do not yet have the programs that mirror those values. Now the work is to build the programs and learning opportunities to enable all students to attain multilingual proficiency.

$21^{\text {st }}$ Century Student Outcomes and Support Systems
The key elements of $21^{\text {st }}$ century learning are represented in this graphic which represents both $21^{\text {st }}$ century student outcomes (as represented by the arches of the rainbow) and $21^{\text {st }}$ century learning support systems (as represented by the pools at the bottom). While the graphic represents each element distinctly for descriptive purposes, P21 views all the components as fully interconnected in the process of 21 st century teaching and learning. Partnership for 21st Century Skills: Framework for $21^{\text {st }}$ Century Learning

## Charting Pathways to Blititracy

For English Learners, pathways to biliteracy should include the development of academic proficiency in the student's primary language as well as English. Proficient biliteracy is a high standard. Research has demonstrated that it can take five to seven years of language development and the use of both languages in academic settings to achieve this standard.

The California State Seal of Biliteracy sets minimum criteria for the level of biliteracy proficiency needed to attain the award:

- Completion of all English requirements for graduation with an overall GPA of 2.0 or above
- Passage of the state standards test in English Language Arts for grade 11 at a level equivalent to Proficient or above
- Options for demonstrating proficiency in the language other than English include:
- passage of the Advanced Placement Exam with a level of 3 or higher
- International Baccalaureate exam with level of 4 or higher
- successful completion of four years of high school course of study in world languages with 3.0 in those courses
- SAT II test scores at 600+
- a school district exam that is equivalent
- English Learners must be Proficient on the state English Language Proficiency assessment

Along the pathway to attainment of high-level biliterate competency, there are developmental stages. For young children, even awareness that multiple languages exist and that people can speak and use different languages for communication is a foundational understanding. Exposure to the sounds and phrases of a new language opens the door to build motivation, interest and an "ear" for languages. Enrichment and exposure are an entry into serious language study. Language study then needs to build in an articulated sequence towards linguistic and cultural

proficiency and should continue through to academic uses of the language at a university and professional level.

Multiple program models and language-teaching approaches play a role in moving students along this language-learning continuum - providing various entry points into the study of world languages, serving different student needs. Some programs are designed to build upon the home language skills children bring to school (and avoid the loss of those skills), with research-based models to develop English simultaneously with the home language and continue with both languages to attainment of biliteracy. Other programs are

Page 10
designed to provide exposure and introduction to a new language for students, inciting motivation for continued language study. And still others are designed as intentional, long-term language study integrated with academic instruction and articulated across grade-levels in order to develop students capacity to engage in high level academic work in two languages.

## Characteristics of Ouality Language Learning Models

Regardless of the specific program model, several key characteristics should be reflected across the language learning options. These include:

- Integration of language and culture, intentionally teaching and learning the ways in which language reflects a culture and ways of thinking
- Active engagement in producing language, and use of the language for meaningful interaction
- Contrastive analysis that builds meta-linguistic understanding of how language works across language systems
- An affirming climate about linguistic and cultural diversity, including learning about the benefits of bilingualism
- Standards aligned curriculum (ELD/ELA and World Language) articulated across grade levels and schools.
- High quality instructional materials
- Exposure to high-level, expressive and authentic language models and texts
- Valid and appropriate assessment used for student placement and to monitor progress
- Age appropriate instruction
- Language instruction that is appropriately differentiated and scaffolded for students at different levels of language proficiency

- A system of professional development and support for teachers
- Where possible, the use of technology integrated into teaching and learning, and used to engage students in interactive and generative learning that develops rich language - and to connect students to places in this global world in which the language they are studying is used.

Language Learning Opportunities and Programs: Components of Pathways to Biliteracy

| Opportunity/ Program | Grade Levels | Target Students | Goals | Description |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Dual Language or Two Way Bilingual Immersion | K-12 | English Learners and English dominant students | Promote bilingualism and biliteracy (English plus target language) and positive crosscultural attitude and behavior. | Whole school day program in elementary; continues as course in secondary. Begins with $50-90 \%$ of instruction in target language with increasing English until academic work and literacy are 50:50. In secondary grades, some courses remain in target language. Integrates native English speakers and speakers of the target language - providing instruction in both languages to all students together. |
| Immersion | K-8 | Non-speakers of the target language | Proficiency and academic study in a target language | Target language is used for all academic instruction (with the exception of language arts in English). Maintain a ratio of target language use to English as high as 80/20 throughout elementary grades |
| Transitional Bilingual Education | K-3 | English Learners | Improved access to full curriculum, and transition to English | Whole school day program. Academic curriculum is taught through home language, including initial literacy, plus ELD. Transition to all English instruction in 2nd or 3rd grade. |
| Developmental or Maintenance Bilingual/ Biliteracy | K-12 | English Learners | Academic study and literacy development in both home language and English | Whole school day program in elementary grades; continues as a course in secondary. Academic curriculum is taught initially through home language plus ELD, with increasing academic instruction in English until students develop literacy in both languages. Academic study in both languages continues. |
| Heritage Language program | K-12 | For language minority students who are English dominant and are desiring to learn the heritage language | Reclaim a heritage language | Generally a course or afterschool opportunity with significant focus on the heritage culture as well as language |
| FLEX (Foreign Language Elementary Experience) | K-5 | Non-native speakers of the target language | Exposure, enrichment, language experience | A designated period of the school day or afterschool program (usually a few times a week) providing basic exposure to a language |
| FLES (Foreign Language in Elementary Schools) | K-5 | Non-native speakers of the target language | Language study | A designated period of the school day or afterschool program dedicated to language study. Varies greatly in amount of time. |


| Opportunity/ Program | Grade <br> Levels | Target Students | Goals | Description |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Native Speakers Courses | 6-12 | For speakers of a language other than English | Language and literacy skills in the target language | A course of language study designed for native speakers of the target language. High school curriculum is aligned with UC/CSU A-G requirements and courses are articulated with Advanced Placement Language classes. |
| Advanced Placement Courses | 9-12 | For students with foundation in the target language | College level proficiency in the target language college credit | Courses designed for advanced students who demonstrate proficiency in reading, writing, listening and speaking in target language |
| Study Abroad, International student exchange programs | 6-12 | For all students | Cultural exposure and study of language within its cultural context | Generally a few weeks to a semester. Students live in another country and study the language. |
| Partnerships | K-12 | For all students | Language study | Partnerships with community language schools, universities, or international language programs. Often used when a school or district does not have the capacity to teach the language. Students earn school credits for courses taken elsewhere |
| Language infused Career Tech Courses, Pathways and Academies | $9-12$ | For all students | Language proficiency related to specific careers | Language study is integrated with the uses of the language in specific careers and industries. Language study is integrated with the uses of the language in specific careers and industries, and focuses on career specific vocabulary and language functions. |
| Global Education Connections Online (Global Learning Networks) | 3-12 | For all students | Cultural connection and active use of languages for communication | Classroom to classroom connections between students in the U.S. and other nations for communication, joint projects and learning. Bilingual skills are used. |
| Online language learning | K-12 | For all students | Language learning | Computer lab and classroom opportunities to develop and practice language skills using World Language software |
| Credit for proficiency | 9-12 | For students who have developed proficiency in a language other than English outside of U.S. schools | Recognize and give credit for existing language skills | Students have an opportunity to gain school credit for language proficiency through assessments. |

## GUIDANCE FOR DISTRICTS

## What is Involved in Creating a System of Pathways to Biliteracy?

All of the above programs and learning opportunities can play a role in launching or moving students along the continuum towards biliteracy. The expansion of language programs and language-learning opportunities can be accomplished step by step by adding a world language course or a heritage speakers course, expanding secondary course offerings to include a few more contentbased courses in a world language, starting a new Dual Language program, etc. These steps expand opportunities for some students - but they do not add up to creating coherent pathways to biliteracy unless there is a broader plan for a PreK-12 pipeline that addresses issues of articulation and sequencing across grade levels and schools. A pathway to biliteracy requires knitting together a set of language-learning options taking students from initial exposure through to high-level proficiency. For example, students may begin in a transitional bilingual education program for English Learners, but then move into FLES or Native speakers classes. This provides a continuing opportunity to develop their home language, and to engage in academic work in their home language as well as English, after reclassification as English proficient. These can lead into Advanced Placement classes in high school where former English Learners are mixed with other World Language students.

The goal is to build pathways towards biliteracy. While many agree that world language study and mastery of several languages is of high value, currently, few districts are actually planning for the development of a school system that supports such a goal. The advent of local control funding and accountability offers local districts an opportunity to craft a Language Plan that is appropriate for their goals of $21^{\text {st }}$ century communicators. For any district, building pathways to biliteracy begins with clarity about the district's goals and intent includes the development of a Language Plan that explicates the program pathways and addresses issues of access, an active campaign of community engagement, and requires support for quality implementation.


## Step One: <br> Establish a District Vision and Goal

A Pathways to Biliteracy effort begins with a district statement emanating from the Board or Superintendent articulating the goals and vision of the world language/biliteracy initiative. Such statements might include, for example:

- A commitment to language-learning opportunity: "All students in our district will have the opportunity to enroll in a language program leading to proficiency in two or more languages."
- A statement of district values: "Our district values the attainment of proficiency in two or more languages."
- Establishment of specific goals: "By 2020, 50\% of our graduating seniors will qualify for the Seal of Biliteracy."
- Setting a requirement: "A minimum of three years of World Language study is a requirement for graduation from bigh school."
In San Bernardino, for example, biliteracy is one of four strategic priorities written into the District's Five Year Strategic Plan. Making the goal of biliteracy a highly visible priority in a district sets the stage for quality implementation.

The process of developing a district vision and goal statement may emanate from a Superintendent or the School Board, but it is important that all leaders (school board members, district administrators and staff) are knowledgeable about the array of comprehensive language programs leading to biliteracy, actively support them, communicate their value, and promote the language program options to others.

## San Francisco Unified: A Community Process for Developing a Multilingual Vision and Plan

On December 16, 2006, the SFUSD Board of Education formalized their commitment to multilingualism with a historic Resolution, "Preparing all students for a multilingual/Multicultural World." The resolution called for taking full advantage of the rich "linguistic and cultural diversity and assets" of San Francisco to provide the opportunity for every student, prekindergarten through twelfth grade, to become multilingual and multicultural and to graduate fluent in English and at least one other language. The preface articulated a powerful commitment:
"The world we live in has become increasingly smaller and people of different languages and cultures are being brought ever closer. Preparing students for our world of multilingualism and multiculturalism has become an integral and indispensable part of the educational process."
To guide the district towards implementation of this resolution, the Superintendent appointed an 18-member Blue Ribbon Task Force to determine a year-by-year phase in for the vision. The Task Force represented a diverse spectrum of the community (parents, community members, teachers, school planners, language experts, higher education representatives and civic leaders). Their report set a vision statement for the district:
"To prepare all SFUSD students, including English Learners, to become global citizens in a multilingual/multicultural world by providing the opportunity for all students to graduate with proficiency in English and at least one other language through participation in a well-articulated, PreK-12 world language program."
In addition, the Blue Ribbon Task Force report laid-out challenges facing the district in honoring the resolution (e.g., lack of middle school language programs, lack of multiple entry points into language programs, inadequate parent information about program options, the need for clearer articulation across the levels, etc.). A set of recommendations was offered to guide the district in addressing the challenges and implementing the vision of the resolution. By 2013, the district had built a wide range of world language programs PreK-12, articulated across grade levels, and placed accessibly throughout the city. Their offerings now include:

- 15 Dual Language Programs at elementary schools (Cantonese, Korean, Mandarin and Spanish)
- 11 Dual Language programs in middle schools (Cantonese/ Mandarin combined, Korean, Spanish)
- One Chinese K-8 Immersion program

- 27 elementary Developmental Bilingual programs (Cantonese, Filipino and Spanish)
- Nine high school biliteracy programs that are continuations of the elementary bilingual and Dual Language programs combined (Cantonese and Spanish)
- Six elementary schools with a FLES program of 30-60 minutes per day (Filipino, Japanese, Italian and Spanish)
- World Language programs articulated through Advanced Placement at three middle schools and 15 high schools (Cantonese, Filipino, French, Hebrew, Italian, Japanese, Latin, Mandarin, Russian and Spanish).
Because of the implementation of these programs, the numbers of students qualifying for the Seal of Biliteracy has grown exponentially.



## Step Two: Develop a District Plan

A well-articulated PreK-12 Multiliteracy Pathways/World Language Plan or Roadmap for a district describes the language programs that comprise a coherent set of language development opportunities PreK-12, as well as the supports needed for students to achieve the goal of mastery in two or more languages. It moves a district from an ad hoc approach to a coherent system of language-learning opportunities. For example, San Diego Unified School District created a World Language plan laying out a combination of research-based program options, including bilingual programs, Dual Language immersion programs, World language programs and courses beginning in grade seven, and language enrichment programs including the International Baccalaureate Elementary school programs, FLES and Extended Day language programs.

In Fall 2013, Californians Together convened a small group of Superintendents and other educational leaders from districts invested in the development of biliteracy. The convening focused on the lessons learned and the challenges districts face in building programs and pathways. The group identified key issues a district should consider in developing their Pathways to Biliteracy plans:

## Integration of English Learner Services with World Language

Pathways to Biliteracy need to engage both the English Learner programs and the World Language programs. In many districts, these are wholly separate entities. It takes intentional invitations to the table, facilitated dialogue and learning across the two sectors, and a shared visioning of how students can move through the pathways of second and third language learning for all students in order to achieve multilingual proficiency.

## Plan for the Amount of Time Needed for Language Study, Sequencing and Articulation

 One of the limitations of the approach to World Languages in many districts is the limited time allotted for world language instruction in K-12, preventing students from acquiring high-level competence in a target language, and narrowing the language options. The typical 300 hours of instruction spread over two years of high school is woefully inadequate for high school students to develop any usable level of proficiency. A District Plan needs to address an articulated sequence of opportunities/courses that start early (elementary school), and that take students from initialexposure to a language through to advanced proficiency. Sequencing courses and articulation across school levels allows students to build upon prior learning, which is essential for proficiency. Typically, districts do not have an elementary foreign language program. Those that do have elementary programs are often forced to place their students back into a Level 1 world language course when they enter middle school, due to the lack of advanced course options.

## Provide for Multiple Entry Points into Language Learning

It should never be too late for a student to begin to study a new language. For new students entering the district, for students who develop an interest in a world language at any point in their development, there should be language-learning opportunities available. Thus, enrollment in a Dual Language program in kindergarten or first grade cannot be the only pathway into dual language learning. Districts need to consider providing entry points at least at the start of each school level.

## Benchmark and Celebrate Progress towards Bliteracy

Institute a process of benchmarking progress and celebrate student participation and achievement along the continuum towards high-level proficiency. This might include, for example, Pathway Awards at key milestones and critical developmental points along the pathway towards biliteracy (e.g., preschool graduation, 3rd grade, English Learner reclassification, elementary school graduation, middle school graduation) - culminating in the awarding of the Seal of Biliteracy at graduation from high school. (For full description of Pathway Awards, see the Seal of Biliteracy section of the Californians Together website: www.californianstogether.org).

## Consider Equitable Access to Language Learning

In many districts, whole communities are not served by schools with Advanced Placement courses in world languages - or have access to only very limited choice of languages compared to other communities. A District Plan takes into consideration equitable access through approaches such as strategically placing programs at school sites in different quadrants of the district, sharing teachers across sites, providing transportation, and use of distance learning.

## Address the Differing Needs of Subgroups of Students

Design programs with specific strategies for English Learners, Standard English Learners, Heritage Language Learners and English monolingual students.


Language programs for all preschool and kindergarten programs across the district - building dual language education one grade at a time from that foundation. In China all children begin studying a second language starting at age eight.

## Engage Stakeholders in the Development of the Plan

Because decisions about placing language learning opportunities in specific schools impact community school participation and access to language pathways, the engagement of all stakeholders is crucial to developing a strong and workable plan.

As an example, the Glendale Unified School District has created a K-12 Master Plan for Dual Immersion Programs. This plan was developed over the course of two years with input from parents, administrators, teachers and staff. The purpose is to have a comprehensive approach that delineates the path each dual immersion program takes, $\mathrm{K}-6, \mathrm{~K}-8$, or $\mathrm{K}-12$, and identifies the schools at which the programs will be located taking into consideration articulation across elementary, middle and high school.

## Consider Language Priorities and How to Facilitate Participation in Pathways Through to High Levels of Proficiency

Because a pathway to biliteracy in any one language is a commitment over multiple years, a district has to carefully consider a balance between a desire for offering multiple languages and the realities of investment and "space" within school schedules to accommodate the sequence of courses involved in building to high levels of proficiency. Full pathways to proficiency may be offered for only a select group of languages, with opportunities for more limited development of others. For example, in Ysleta, TX, a dual immersion Language Academy offers a full dual immersion program K-12 in Spanish and English, but their students also study a third language beginning in elementary school on a more limited basis focused more on exposure and basic competency.

Glendale Unified School District in California began in 2003 with one Spanish dual language program. Responding to popularity and success of the program, and with a Foreign Language Assistance Program grant, the district added programs. Five years later, sites were added in multiple languages (Korean, Armenian, French, Italian, German, Japanese) to a total of seven Dual Language programs. As students moved up in the grades, the programs moved into middle school. As a consequence of the success of the language programs, and continuing community demands for additional programs and for the extension of language study into high school, district planning has had to now determine which languages will have continuing full programs in the high schools - and which high school sites can accommodate which language program. The district has added a seventh period to the school day in the high schools to enable students in Dual Immersion strands to continue their language study and still have access to other electives.


## Step Three: <br> Build a District, Community and School Culture That Celebrates Language and Cultural Diversity and the Pursuit of Biliteracy as a Needed $21^{\text {st }}$ Century Skill

Superintendents of districts which have made a commitment to the development of world language programs stress the tremendous importance of educating people (within the district and in the community) about the benefits of biliteracy, addressing outdated attitudes and beliefs related to bilingual programs, and being very proactive and strategic about building community support for the Pathways to Biliteracy. Elements of this include:

- Post explicit vision statements, signs and images on the walls of schools and the district office that actively impart the value placed on cultural and language diversity and multilingualism.
- Share research on the benefits of bilingualism and the need for biliterate and cross-cultural competency. While there is a strong research base and rationale for building pathways to biliteracy, it is not necessarily known and there are still prevailing counter-beliefs. Furthermore, there continues to be new research from neuroscience on brain benefits and from the business sector on economic benefits. Making this research known is a key to garnering the support needed for successful implementation of programs.
- Communicate regularly with students and parents about the pathway towards biliteracy and to inform them of decisions they can make at all points along the schooling journey that would opt them into language learning or enable continued development of language skills. For example, in the Whittier School district, a mandatory meeting with parents of entering $9^{\text {th }}$ graders is used as an opportunity to distribute a brochure about the Seal of Biliteracy and to discuss the benefits of bilingualism and the program options/course offerings in the high schools. Similarly, meetings with middle school students and parents are held.
- Conduct outreach to parents of your children on raising bilingual children, the benefits of bilingualism, and their rights and opportunities to enroll their children in dual immersion programs and bilingual programs. Launch a public information campaign to build awareness of the language learning opportunities available to children in the district.
- Bring teachers and administrators to visit effective World Language and biliteracy programs, share research, and enlist them as ambassadors in a campaign to increase the number of students on the pathway to biliteracy

San Ysidro School District: "Building a Culture and Commitment to Dual Language Education"
San Ysidro Elementary District is a small district on the U.S.-Mexico International Border. Ninety percent of the students are Hispanic and 65\% are English Learners. Five years ago, the district was struggling to respond to the achievement struggles of both English Learner and reclassified students. Reclassified students entering middle school were losing ground on state standardized tests and struggling academically. English Learners across the district appeared to be stagnating at an Intermediate Level of English proficiency. The district was looking for new ways to support their English Learners by integrating academic language instruction across the curriculum. They had entered into a Compact for Success with Sweetwater High School District, which required two years of "foreign language" for all students.

And yet the typical pattern was that students who enrolled in San Ysidro elementary schools with Spanish as their language, were losing it and no longer had proficiency in Spanish by the time they arrived at high school entry. The districts decided to offer Spanish for Native Speakers courses in middle school, enabling their students to complete the two-year foreign language requirement in middle school, thereby freeing their high school years to pursue Advanced Placement Spanish classes and other electives.
Students who had "lost" their Spanish skills in the elementary years recovered their language through the Spanish for Native Speakers program and developed academic Spanish. The program had the added benefit of providing a vehicle for newcomer students to enroll in Spanish Language classes while learning English. Through this collaboration with the Sweetwater Union High School District, San Ysidro students were entering high school now much stronger academically. Students at San Ysidro High School now have the highest Advanced Placement scores in Spanish in the United States. The two districts, working together, had built a powerful pathway into high levels of Spanish proficiency.

This success motivated San Ysidro Elementary District to explore Dual Language programs, which have now become a cornerstone of the district's academic and language education approach. Students maintain and develop their Spanish into an academic resource, and English proficiency has also improved due to skill transference. The excellent results have resulted in widespread community support.

Superintendent Gloria Madera explains: "We now have a culture of biliteracy. We have come to the realization that our students are truly Bi-National students. They come to us representing two cultures, two nations, two languages. They live the dynamics of the international border - with skills to participate in and across both worlds. Biliteracy is in their best interests and in ours. Parents, business partners and the community understand the advantages of bilingualism and are demanding it for their children. The first year we had to mount a major public relations campaign to recruit students to the programs. Now we have long waiting lists for our Dual Language programs. There is no way to stop it now."


## Step Four:

 Ensure Support for Quality ImplementationA robust set of pathways towards biliteracy depends upon having qualified teachers with the language-skills to deliver programs. World language teachers consistently appear on the U.S. Department of Education's Teacher Shortage Areas Nationwide listings each year. In California, the Department of Education has cited foreign language as an area of teacher shortage every year since 2002. Many California schools look abroad to fill vacancies. California is one of the top states in the U.S. to apply for labor condition applications to bring teachers from foreign countries to teach in schools. While this approach helps to some degree, it is a stop- gap measure, that is not sufficient to support sustainable and quality world language programs. While overseas teachers may be very experienced, they often leave after one or two years when their visas expire, making it difficult to sustain long-term quality programs. After Proposition 227 passed in California, fewer teacher candidates entered the Bilingual BCLAD teacher credential programs, so the pipeline of bilingual teachers dwindled.

As part of a Pathways to Biliteracy Plan, districts need to create and implement a retention, recruitment and professional development system that results in identifying and hiring teachers with needed skills, creating a teaching force that embraces the value of multiliteracy, and has the skills,
commitment and energy essential to achieve the goal of providing a $21^{\text {st }}$ century language education for students. This includes:

- Active recruitment of multilingual teachers - including a priority for new hiring on teachers who speak more than one language
- Collaboration/planning time for teachers to align and articulate the language curriculum across grade levels and schools
- Staffing language programs with teachers who possess near native like fluency, including academic language in the target language
- Providing teachers with professional development support to effectively implement research-based languageinstruction strategies and methodologies



## Los Angeles Unified School District: Planning for Staff Capacity as Part of a Commitment to Prepare Students for a Multilingual Global Economy

In February 2013, the Los Angeles City Board of Education passed a"Commitment to Prepare Students for a Multilingual Global Economy" resolution. Citing the need to provide students with a $21^{\text {st }}$ century education preparing students in linguistic proficiency in at least one or more world languages, and the research on achievement gains for students in dual language programs, the resolution affirmed a commitment to develop and expand Dual Language Programs as a key instructional strategy for the district to "ensure that all students receive the academic language foundations through instructional pathways necessary to graduate college and be career ready in a global, multilingual, multicultural society and economy."

- The resolution went beyond that powerful commitment to specify the Human Resources steps that would need to be taken to realize the intent of the resolution. Although not yet realized, the components of the plan includes:
- In order to ensure full staffing and capacity in all District Dual Language programs, the Board authorizes Superintendent to invest in and operationalize diverse recruiting strategies, including facilitating visas, granting credential waivers and issuing emergency permits for teachers and substitute teachers in less-commonly taught languages
- In order to encourage innovative curricula and instructional models in dual language programs, the Board authorizes the Superintendent to invest when funds are available in curriculum specialists at individual dual language programs
- The Superintendent shall direct the APOP office with developing comprehensive professional development plans for teachers in dual language programs, including participation in conferences on pedagogy in the target language

Partnerships with Schools of Education and Institutions of Higher education can play an important role in supporting the development and expansion of language programs, through their teacher preparation programs. For example, in response to a demand for new bilingual and dual language instruction teachers, Fresno State has designed a new Masters in Multilingual Education. Similarly, the University of California at Riverside has a Dual Language Teachers program, closely tied to San Bernardino City Schools with a strategic priority on building dual language programs.

## AwARD ELIGIBILITY <br> Multiple Pathways to Biliteracy District Recognition Awards

In April 2014, Californians Together launched the Statewide Campaign for Biliteracy to inspire and support districts to establish comprehensive policies, programs and pathways that provide opportunities for students to reach high levels of biliteracy. One component of the campaign is the Multiple Pathways to Biliteracy District Recognition Award, identifying and celebrating districts that are leading the way to world-class language education. To be eligible to receive the award, a district has to meet the following criteria:
$\square$ District must have an established State Seal of Biliteracy program that has granted awards to graduating seniors for at least two years (for districts enrolling students in grades 9 - 12)
$\square$ District must have instituted a system of benchmarking and monitoring progress towards high levels of biliteracy, and of recognizing and awarding student progress along that continuum at key milestones and crucial developmental points, e.g., preschool graduation, 3rd grade, elementary school graduation, middle school graduation, culmination or completion of specific language programs (for districts enrolling students in grades K-8).
$\square$ District must have a well-articulated PreK-12 Plan describing the language programs that comprise a coherent set of language development opportunities leading towards proficiency in two or more languages. The Plan needs to consider:

- integration of English Learner services with World Language programs
- the amount of time allotted to language study, and the sequencing and articulation of courses
- multiple entry points into language learning
- equitable access to language learning
- addressing the different needs and appropriate pathways for subgroups of students (e.g., English Learners, heritage language learners, English monolingual or English dominant students, Standard English Learners)
$\square$ District must have demonstrated support for quality implementation, including hiring and retention of qualified teachers, professional development, curriculum development support.
$\square$ District must have instituted strategies and a track-record for building a district, community and school culture that celebrates language and cultural diversity in the pursuit of biliteracy.

The Ventura Unified School District's Seal of Biliteracy Program was honored in 2013 with a Certificate of Recognition at the California Association for Bilingual Education Conference.


## Moving the State Forward

Districts throughout California are leading the way in setting goals and taking steps to build opportunities for students to become linguistically proficient in multiple languages. A robust effort to build those needed skills for our state also requires state leadership. Legislation creating the California Seal of Biliteracy was a visionary step that has modeled for the nation how a state can recognize and encourage students to develop high-level language proficiencies. Now it is time to create the roadmap, set state goals, provide leadership and resources, and institute professional development and technical assistance supports to ensure that all students in our state have the opportunities to enroll in programs that build skills of biliteracy that support and strengthen our economic and our communities.

Join the Campaign for Biliteracy and help make California the first state in the nation to prepare all of our students to graduate high school proficient in English and another language, and prepared to participate in the diverse $21^{\text {st }}$ century global world.

## Appendix - What are Other States Doing?

## State of Oregon: Language Roadmap for the $21^{\text {st }}$ Century

The Oregon Roadmap to Language Excellence was developed "to create the conditions that will allow every Oregon graduate to be professionally proficient in English and functionally proficiency in another language by 2025." The opening statement of the Roadmap reads: "As this goal is achieved, Oregon will become a place where every guest feels welcome, and every citizen can contribute to the social, economic and cultural life of the sate. Oregonians' superior command of the language and culture will provide a sustainable competitive edge. The Oregon brand will be inclusive, internationally aware, and forward looking." In Oregon, public and private employers who need workers able to take advantage of $21^{\text {st }}$ century opportunities are the primary drivers of the effort. The plan cites the demand from Oregon's globally oriented businesses for highly skilled and internationally literate workers, the demand for domestically oriented employers for workers able to deliver services to speakers of various heritage languages and overseas visitors. The Oregon Plan calls upon universities and employers to incentivize proficiency in two or more languages, and sets forth an ambitious plan to implement flagship programs, build teacher capacity, enhance diplomas, create internships and partnerships, incentivize and support study abroad and build online learning opportunities for students in rural areas with less language-teaching capacity.

## The State of Minnesota: World Language Pilot Program Grants

In 2007, the Minnesota Legislature took two actions to address the need for building world language programs in the state. They commissioned a legislative report to present a picture of the current status of $\mathrm{K}-12$ world language education as the basis for planning for the future. The report surveyed every school district about existing language programs, teacher capacity, challenges, and plans. The legislation also established and provided funding for five world language pilot program grants for school districts intending to develop new world language programs or expand existing ones. The response was overwhelming, and the legislature has expanded the program.

## State of Maryland: Race to the Top World Languages Pipeline

The state of Maryland incorporated the goal of biliteracy into their Race to the Top plan by including a Top World Languages Pipeline Project. They wrote: "Maryland's competitive edge depends on the preparation of graduates who are bighly skilled in science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) and proficiency in languages other than English." As a part of their Federal Race to the Top funding, the World Languages Pipeline Project was designed to plan and implement K-5 programs in Arabic, Chinese and Spanish.

## State Of Utah

In 2008, the Utah Senate passed the International initiatives, creating funding for Utah schools to begin Dual Language Immersion programs in Chinese, French and Spanish. Then Governor John Huntsman initiated a Governor's Language Summit and World Language council - with a goal of creating a K-12 language Roadmap for Utah that would address the needs for language skills in business, government and education. Two years later, Governor Gary Herbert and State

Superintended of Public Institute issued a challenge to Utah educators to implement 1000 Dual Language immersion programs throughout the state by 2015, with a goal of enrolling 30,0000 Utah students.

## State Of Delaware

In 2012, the Governor of Delaware created an aggressive World Language Expansion Initiative, citing the need for world language capacity in the state to maintain and strengthen its domestic economy. The initiative starts students in elementary immersion programs in kindergarten or first grade, in Mandarin or Spanish. The pathways enable students to achieve Advanced Placement credit by ninth grade, and then begin study of an additional world language.

Thank you to the members of the Californians Together Campaign for Biliteracy Committee:
Lynne Aoki, National Association for Multicultural Education
Jan Gustafson-Corea, California Association for Bilingual Education
Nancy Hofrock, California Teacher's Association, Liason
Elizabeth Jimenez, GEMAS
Magaly Lavadenz, Center for Equity for English Learners at Loyola Marymount University
Rosa Molina, Association of Two-Way and Dual Language Education
Laurie Olsen, Sobrato Early Academic Language Program
Cheryl Ortega, United Teachers Los Angeles
Feliza Ortiz-Licon, National Council of La Raza
Francisca Sanchez, California Association for Bilingual Education
Peter Schilla, Californians Together
Shelly Spiegel-Coleman, Californians Together
Martha Zaragoza-Diaz, Californians Together

We are indebted to the Superintendents and educational leaders who shared their vision, expertise and guidance about building pathways to biliteracy:

Trudy Arriaga, Superintendent, Ventura Unified School District
Karen Cadiero-Kaplan, English Learner Support Division, California Department of Education
Linda Kaminski, Superintendent, Azusa Unified School District
Gloria Madera, Superintendent, San Ysidro School District
Raul Maldonado, Superintendent, McFarland Unified School District
Lillian Maldonado French, Superintendent, Mountain View School District
Dale Marsden, Superintendent, San Bernardino City School District
Richard Sheehan, Superintendent, Glendale Unified School District
Sandy Thorstenson, Superintendent, Whittier Union High School District

## Caliornians Together Supporting and Member Organizations

2-Way California Association for Bilingual Education (2-Way CABE)
Advancing Justice
Asian Pacific Islanders California Action Network (APIsCan)
Association of Mexican American Educators (AMAE)
Association of Two Way Dual Immersion Education (ATDLE)
California Association for Asian Pacific Bilingual Education (CAFABE)
California Association for Bilingual Education (CABE)
California Association of Bilingual Educators-Political Action Committee (CABE-PAC)
California Council on Teacher Education (CCTE)
California Federation of Teachers (CFT)
California Latino School Boards Association (CLSBA)
California Rural Legal Assistance Foundation (CRLAF)
California School Boards Association (CSBA)
California Teachers Association
California Teachers of English to Speakers of Other Languages (CATESOL)
Center for Equity for English Learners, Loyola Marymount University (CEEL)
Centro Latino for Literacy
Early Edge California
Excellence and Justice in Education (EJE)
Families in Schools (FIS)
Institute for Social Innovation, Fielding Graduate School
National Association for Multicultural Education (NAME)
National Council of La Raza (NCLR)
Parent Institute for Quality Education (PIQE)
Parents for Unity
United Teachers Los Angeles

Championing the Success of English Learners
www.californianstogether.org


[^0]:    Californians Together developed the concept of a Seal of Biliteracy in 2008 and worked throughout the state to help school sites, districts and others adopt and implement the Seal. Over 197 school districts are currently granting the awards, and increasing numbers of state and national professional organizations and other entities have endorsed the Seal. For an updated listing of districts awarding the Seal and a current list of endorsements, go to http://www.cde.ca.gov/sp/el/er/sealofbiliteracy.asp and www.sealofbiliteracy.org.

